SB5506 Wage and Rate Study

Study Findings and Recommendations

Attachment 3C: Provider Survey Analysis -APD Adult Day Services Agencies

Wage and Rate Study

APD Adult Day Services - Provider Survey Analysis

prepared for:

Oregon Department of Human Services

prepared by:

Burns & Associates a Division of Health Management Associates www.healthmanagement.com/about/burns-associates/

October 7, 2024

Table of Contents

| ummary | |
|---|----|
| Summary of Survey Participation | 1 |
| virect Care Staff | |
| Wages | 2 |
| Wage Differentials | 3 |
| Benefits | 4 |
| Turnover | |
| Training | 6 |
| ervice Specific Summaries | |
| Adult Day Services | 7 |
| xpenses | |
| Summary of Expenses for Adult Day Services. | 9 |
| Summary of Expenses for All Other Programs. | 10 |

| | Prov | vider Response | Rate | F | FY2023 Claims | | | |
|---------------|-------|----------------|------|-------------|---------------|-----|--|--|
| | Total | Responded | % | Total | Responded | % | | |
| All Providers | 13 | 3 | 23% | \$1,883,988 | \$622,624 | 33% | | |

Direct Care Staff Wages¹

| | | All | Staff (Excl | ludes Con | tractors) | | | | All Staff (Excludes Supervisors and Contractors) | | | | | | |
|--------------------|----------|--|-------------|-----------|-----------|-------------------|-------------------|---------------------|--|----------|---------|----------|---------|-------------------|-------------------|
| | | | | | | | | Hourly Wages | | | | | | | |
| | Respond- | Respond- Reported Average Average Median Wghtd Wghtd | | | | | | | | Reported | Average | Average | Median | Wghtd | Wghtd |
| | ents | Hours | | | | Avg. ² | Avg. ² | ents | | Hours | | | | Avg. ² | Avg. ² |
| | | | w/ otl. | w/o otl. | | w/ otl. | w/o otl. | | | | w/ otl. | w/o otl. | | w/ otl. | w/o otl. |
| | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Adult Day Services | 3 | 29,272 | \$18.05 | \$18.05 | \$17.56 | \$18.33 | \$18.33 | 3 | | 27,192 | \$17.67 | \$17.67 | \$17.56 | \$17.80 | \$17.80 |

| Contractors Only | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|------------------|--------------|---------|----------|--------|-------------------|-------------------|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|
| | Hourly Wages | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Respond- | Reported | Average | Average | Median | Wghtd | Wghtd | | | | | | | | | |
| ents | Hours | | | | Avg. ² | Avg. ² | | | | | | | | | |
| | | w/ otl. | w/o otl. | | w/ otl. | w/o otl. | | | | | | | | | |

| Adult Day Services | 0 |
|--------------------|---|

¹Reported wages for executive management, nurses, and kitchen staff are excluded.

²Weighted averages are weighted using reported direct care hours.

Direct Care Wage Differentials

| # of Responding Providers | 3 |
|---------------------------|----|
| # of Reported Staff | 25 |

| | Pay | ys Wage | Differen | tial | Hourly Wage Differential | | | | | | | |
|---------|----------------------|------------------|------------------------|---------------------------------|----------------------------|---------------|-----------|-----------------|---------------------------------|--|--|--|
| Device. | esponding gencies | of Agencies that | of Agencies that ay | of Staff w/ Wage ifferential | verage (Mean) ith Outliers | verage (Mean) | edian | eighted Average | eighted Average ithout Outliers | | | |
| Benefit | R¢ A§ | # e Pa | % Pa | % Di | A, wi | A vi | \square | W xi | W | | | |

Differential Type

| 99 | | | | | | | | | |
|------------------------|---|---|-----|----|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|
| Geographic | 3 | 0 | 0% | 0% | | | | | |
| Client Acuity-Based | 3 | 0 | 0% | 0% | | | | | |
| Night or Weekend Shift | 3 | 0 | 0% | 0% | | | | | |
| Bilingual | 3 | 0 | 0% | 0% | | | | | |
| Other | 3 | 1 | 33% | 8% | \$1.00 | \$1.00 | \$1.00 | \$1.00 | \$1.00 |

Benefits for Direct Care Workers

| | Full-Time | Part-Time |
|---------------------------|-----------|-----------|
| # of Responding Providers | 2 | 3 |
| # of Reported Staff | 8 | 17 |

| | , | Access to | Benefit | : | | | Eligi | bility <i>an</i> | ong Age | ncies tha | t Offer Be | nefit | | | Benef | fit Level | Among S | Staff Rec | eiving | |
|------------------|------------------------|-----------------------------|-----------------------------|-------------------------------|---------------------------------|------------------------------------|-----------|-----------------------------------|--------------------------------------|---------------------------------|------------------------------------|-----------|-----------------------------------|--------------------------------------|------------------------------|---------------------------------|----------------------|--------------------------------|-----------------------------------|-------------------------|
| | | | | | | % of | Staff Eli | gible | | | % of St | aff Parti | icipating | | | | Benefit ² | | | vel ³ |
| Benefit | Responding Agencies | # of Agencies that Offer | % of Agencies that Offer | % of Staff who Have Access | Average (Mean) with Outliers | Average (Mean) without Outliers | Median | Weighted Average with Outliers | Weighted Average without Outliers | Average (Mean) with Outliers | Average (Mean) without Outliers | Median | Weighted Average with Outliers | Weighted Average without Outliers | Average (Mean) with Outliers | Average (Mean) without Outliers | Median | Weighted Average with Outliers | Weighted Average without Outliers | Effective Benefit Level |
| Full-Time | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Holidays | 2 | 2 | 100% | 100% | 100% | 100% | 100% | 100% | 100% | | | | | | 9.5 | 9.5 | 9.5 | 9.3 | 9.3 | 9.3 |
| Paid Time Off | 2 | 2 | 100% | 100% | 100% | 100% | 100% | 100% | 100% | | | | | | 15.0 | 15.0 | 15.0 | 15.5 | 15.5 | 15.5 |
| Health Insurance | 2 | 2 | 100% | 100% | 100% | 100% | 100% | 100% | 100% | 43% | 43% | 43% | 46% | 46% | \$540 | \$540 | \$540 | \$554 | \$554 | \$253 |
| Retirement | 2 | 2 | 100% | 100% | 100% | 100% | 100% | 100% | 100% | 20% | 20% | 20% | 20% | 20% | 4.0% | 4.0% | 4.0% | 4.1% | 4.1% | 0.8% |
| Other Benefits | 2 | 2 | 100% | 100% | 100% | 100% | 100% | 100% | 100% | 43% | 43% | 43% | 46% | 46% | \$39 | \$39 | \$39 | \$39 | \$39 | \$18 |
| Part-Time | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Holidays | 3 | 2 | 67% | 35% | 59% | 59% | 59% | 57% | 57% | | | | | | 9.5 | 9.5 | 9.5 | 9.3 | 9.3 | 1.9 |
| Paid Time Off | 3 | 3 | 100% | 65% | 100% | 100% | 100% | 100% | 100% | | | | | | 10.7 | 10.7 | 10.0 | 12.3 | 12.3 | 7.9 |
| Health Insurance | 3 | 1 | 33% | 18% | 75% | 75% | 75% | 75% | 75% | 0% | 0% | 0% | 0% | 0% | | | | | | |
| Retirement | 3 | 2 | 67% | 18% | 71% | 71% | 71% | 69% | 69% | 21% | 21% | 21% | 24% | 24% | 4.0% | 4.0% | 4.0% | 4.1% | 4.1% | 0.2% |
| Other Benefits | 3 | 1 | 33% | 18% | 75% | 75% | 75% | 75% | 75% | 0% | 0% | 0% | 0% | 0% | | | | | | |
| State Unemployme | nt Insur | ance Rat | te | | | | | | | | | | | | 1.2% | 1.2% | 0.9% | 1.1% | 1.1% | |
| Worker's Compens | | | | vages) | | | | | | | | | | | \$1.65 | \$1.65 | \$1.58 | \$1.66 | \$1.66 | |

¹Weighted averages are weighted using reported revenues

²Holidays, paid time off, and retirement contributions are annual amounts; health insurance and other benefits are monthly amounts

³Effective benefit level is calculated by multiplying weighted average benefit level without outliers by "% of Staff who Have Access" and "% of Staff Participating" (weighted average without outliers)

Turnover for Direct Care Staff

| | Respond- | Average | Average | Median | | Wghtd |
|--------------------|----------|---------|----------|--------|-------------------|-------------------|
| | ents | | | | Avg. ¹ | Avg. ¹ |
| | | w/ otl. | w/o otl. | | w/ otl. | w/o otl. |
| | | | | | | |
| Adult Day Services | 3 | 10% | 10% | 12% | 13% | 13% |

¹Weighted averages are weighted using reported direct care hours.

Training for Direct Care Staff

| | | | 1st Y | ear Trai | ining | | | Followin | ıg Years | Training | | Est. Annual Training Based on Turnover | | | | |
|--------------------|----------|---------|----------|----------|---------|-------------------|---------|----------|----------|----------|-------------------|--|----------|--------|---------|-------------------|
| | Respond- | Avg. | Avg. | Median | Wghtd | Wghtd | Avg. | Avg. | Median | Wghtd | Wghtd | Avg. | Avg. | Median | Wghtd | Wghtd |
| | ents | | | | Avg.1 | Avg. ¹ | | | | Avg.1 | Avg. ¹ | | | | Avg.1 | Avg. ¹ |
| | | w/ otl. | w/o otl. | | w/ otl. | w/o otl. | w/ otl. | w/o otl. | | w/ otl. | w/o otl. | w/ otl. | w/o otl. | | w/ otl. | w/o otl. |
| | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Adult Day Services | 3 | 57 | 57 | 60 | 68 | 68 | 24 | 24 | 15 | 29 | 29 | 28 | 28 | 20 | 34 | 34 |

¹Weighted averages are weighted using reported direct care hours.

Program Details: Adult Day Services

| | All Respondents | | | | | |
|---|-----------------|------------------------|-------------------------|----------|------------------------------|-------------------------------|
| | | Average w/ Outliers | Average w/o Outliers | Median | Weighted Avg. w/ Outliers | Weighted Avg. w/o Outliers |
| Responding providers | 3 | | | | | |
| Number of reported programs | 3 | | | | | |
| Total service recipients | 712 | | | | | |
| Days per week program facilities are operating and providing services | | 4.3 | 4.3 | 5.0 | 4.6 | 4.6 |
| Hours per week program facilities are operating and providing services | | 36 | 36 | 40 | 38 | 38 |
| Square footage of program facility direct service space per person served | | 87 | 87 | 87 | 93 | 93 |
| Operating cost per square foot | | \$13.23 | \$13.23 | \$10.17 | \$11.98 | \$11.98 |
| Weekly program supplies cost per participant | 2 | \$3.24 | \$3.24 | \$3.24 | \$3.43 | \$3.43 |
| Weekly participation fees per participant | 0 | | | | | |
| Attendance rate | | 88% | 88% | 85% | 87% | 87% |
| Agency Caseload and Service Design | | | | | | |
| Number of hours of services provided per week per participant | | 21.7 | 21.7 | 21.0 | 21.5 | 21.5 |
| Staffing ratio (number of participant hours per one staff hour) | | 5.1 | 5.1 | 5.1 | 5.2 | 5.2 |
| Vehicles | - | | | | | - |
| Vehicle size in terms of passengers | | 9 | 9 | 9 | 8 | 8 |
| Percent of vehicles that can accommodate non-ambulatory individuals | | 67% | 67% | 67% | 80% | 80% |
| Purchase price of vehicles | | \$36,500 | \$36,500 | \$36,500 | \$29,068 | \$29,068 |
| Monthly lease cost | | \$500 | \$500 | \$500 | \$500 | \$500 |
| Useful life (in miles) of vehicles before disposal | | 200,000 | 200,000 | 200,000 | 200,000 | 200,000 |
| Miles per individual per week for transportation to/from their homes | | 7 | 7 | 7 | 4 | 4 |
| Miles per individual per week for in-program transportation | | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 |
| Miles per individual per week in staff vehicles | | 14 | 14 | 14 | 14 | 14 |

Program Details: Adult Day Services

| All Respondents | | | | | | | | | |
|-----------------|------------------------|-------------------------|--------|------------------------------|-------------------------------|--|--|--|--|
| | Average w/ Outliers | Average w/o Outliers | Median | Weighted Avg. w/ Outliers | Weighted Avg. w/o Outliers | | | | |
| | _ | _ | | | <u> </u> | | | | |

Staffing Pattern (scaled to a 40-hour workweek)

| Providing Adult Day Services | 25.5 | 25.5 | 24.2 | 25.3 | 25.3 |
|--|----------|------|------|------|------|
| Providing other billable services | 6.4 | 6.4 | 8.8 | 6.1 | 6.1 |
| Transporting participants to/from program | 2.6 | 2.6 | 1.9 | 2.0 | 2.0 |
| Participating in Annual Plan meetings | 0.3 | 0.3 | 0.0 | 0.4 | 0.4 |
| Recordkeeping (excludes documentation during the course of service provision) | 1.2 | 1.2 | 1.0 | 1.4 | 1.4 |
| 'Employer time' (e.g. receiving one-on-one supervision, participating in staff meetings, etc.) | 1.4 | 1.4 | 1.2 | 1.7 | 1.7 |
| Program preparation/set-up/clean-up | 2.7 | 2.7 | 2.9 | 3.1 | 3.1 |
| Other activities | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 |
| Total | 40.0 | 40.0 | 40.0 | 40.0 | 40.0 |

Summary of Expenses for Adult Day Services

| | All Respondents Res | | | Respondents with | Respondents with <50% Rate (Admin. and Prog. Supp.) | | | |
|---|---------------------|-------------|-------------|------------------|---|-------------|--|--|
| Summary | Admin. | Prog. Supp. | Direct Care | Admin. | Prog. Supp. | Direct Care | | |
| Providers | 3 | 3 | 3 | 2 | 2 | 2 | | |
| Median Rate | 15.3% | 5.6% | 50.9% | 17.2% | 4.9% | 60.4% | | |
| Weighted Average Rate | 16.0% | 24.9% | 58.1% | 16.6% | 5.0% | 63.3% | | |
| Detail by Expenditure Category | | | - | | | | | |
| Wages and Salaries | \$86,028 | \$309,439 | \$542,075 | \$31,784 | \$38,223 | \$325,102 | | |
| Payroll taxes and benefits | \$13,203 | \$52,278 | \$73,372 | \$3,566 | \$4,093 | \$34,824 | | |
| Subtotal - Staffing Costs | \$99,231 | \$361,718 | \$615,448 | \$35,350 | \$42,316 | \$359,926 | | |
| Benefits Rate | 13.3% | 14.5% | 11.9% | 10.1% | i . | 9.7% | | |
| Residential program facility expenses | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | | |
| Non-residential program facility expenses | \$0 | \$0 | \$204,101 | \$0 | \$0 | \$150,901 | | |
| Non-program facility expenses | \$26,550 | \$0 | \$0 | \$26,550 | \$0 | \$0 | | |
| Agency owned/leased vehicle expenses | \$1,534 | \$1,842 | \$11,961 | \$1,457 | \$1,457 | \$11,652 | | |
| Reimbursement for use of staff personal vehicles | \$440 | \$53 | \$3,025 | \$40 | \$53 | \$3,025 | | |
| Other travel related expenses (e.g., out of state travel) | \$3,199 | \$0 | \$500 | \$3,199 | \$0 | \$500 | | |
| Other taxes (excludes payroll taxes and personal income taxes) | \$17,958 | \$0 | \$0 | \$17,958 | \$0 | \$0 | | |
| Interest expense (non-mortgage and non-vehicle) | \$1,631 | \$0 | \$0 | \$1,631 | \$0 | \$0 | | |
| All general insurance (excludes vehicle insurance and staff benefits) | \$29,856 | \$0 | \$0 | \$11,258 | \$0 | \$0 | | |
| Licensing/certification/accreditation fees | \$1,168 | \$0 | \$0 | \$1,168 | \$0 | \$0 | | |
| Hiring expenses (e.g., advertising, background checks, etc.) | \$1,671 | \$0 | \$0 | \$255 | \$0 | \$0 | | |
| Organizational culture building and employee retention activities | \$2,657 | \$1,313 | \$0 | \$2,514 | \$31 | \$0 | | |
| Training Expense (e.g., fees and materials; exclude staff costs) | \$1,811 | \$743 | \$0 | \$782 | \$57 | \$0 | | |
| Office equipment and furniture | \$4,766 | \$1,326 | \$0 | \$3,695 | \$256 | \$0 | | |
| Information technology expense (e.g., computers and software) | \$8,162 | \$893 | \$0 | \$6,391 | \$450 | \$0 | | |
| Office supplies | \$12,950 | \$25 | \$0 | \$10,625 | \$25 | \$0 | | |
| Advertising | \$15,182 | \$11,467 | \$0 | \$15,182 | \$0 | \$0 | | |
| Dues and subscriptions | \$2,488 | \$0 | \$0 | \$1,154 | \$0 | \$0 | | |
| Payroll processing costs | \$8,378 | \$0 | \$0 | \$4,578 | \$0 | \$0 | | |
| Professional consulting - legal/accounting/interpretation/etc. | \$3,839 | \$0 | \$0 | \$2,264 | \$0 | \$0 | | |
| Allocated corporate office overhead | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | | |
| Program supplies and participation fees | \$750 | \$0 | \$51,088 | \$750 | \$0 | \$35,213 | | |
| Other | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | | |
| Subtotal - Other Operating Costs | \$144,987 | \$17,662 | \$270,675 | \$111,448 | \$2,327 | \$201,291 | | |
| Total Costs | \$244,217 | \$379,379 | \$886,122 | \$146,798 | \$44,643 | \$561,217 | | |
| Revenues | \$1,524,703 | \$1,524,703 | \$1,524,703 | \$886,246 | \$886,246 | \$886,246 | | |

Summary of Expenses for All Other Programs

| | All Respondents Respondents with <50% Rate (Admin. a | | | and Prog. Supp.) | | |
|---|--|-------------|-------------|------------------|-------------|--------------------|
| Summary | Admin. | Prog. Supp. | Direct Care | Admin. | Prog. Supp. | Direct Care |
| Providers | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 |
| Median Rate | 10.2% | 5.4% | 84.2% | 10.2% | 5.4% | 84.2% |
| Weighted Average Rate | 10.2% | 5.4% | 84.2% | 10.2% | 5.4% | 84.2% |
| Detail by Expenditure Category | | | • | | | |
| Wages and Salaries | \$19,317 | \$25,756 | \$328,386 | \$19,317 | \$25,756 | \$328,386 |
| Payroll taxes and benefits | \$2,331 | \$3,107 | \$39,619 | \$2,331 | \$3,107 | \$39,619 |
| Subtotal - Staffing Costs | \$21,647 | \$28,863 | \$368,006 | \$21,647 | \$28,863 | \$368,006 |
| Benefits Rate | 10.8% | 10.8% | 10.8% | 10.8% | | 10.8% |
| Residential program facility expenses | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 |
| Non-residential program facility expenses | \$0 | \$0 | \$61,802 | \$0 | \$0 | \$61,802 |
| Non-program facility expenses | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 |
| Agency owned/leased vehicle expenses | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 |
| Reimbursement for use of staff personal vehicles | \$40 | \$53 | \$677 | \$40 | \$53 | \$677 |
| Other travel related expenses (e.g., out of state travel) | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 |
| Other taxes (excludes payroll taxes and personal income taxes) | \$2,458 | \$0 | \$0 | \$2,458 | \$0 | \$0 |
| Interest expense (non-mortgage and non-vehicle) | \$1,631 | \$0 | \$0 | \$1,631 | \$0 | \$0 |
| All general insurance (excludes vehicle insurance and staff benefits) | \$4,758 | \$0 | \$0 | \$4,758 | \$0 | \$0 |
| Licensing/certification/accreditation fees | \$518 | \$0 | \$0 | \$518 | \$0 | \$0 |
| Hiring expenses (e.g., advertising, background checks, etc.) | \$200 | \$0 | \$0 | \$200 | \$0 | \$0 |
| Organizational culture building and employee retention activities | \$2,240 | \$0 | \$0 | \$2,240 | \$0 | \$0 |
| Training Expense (e.g., fees and materials; exclude staff costs) | \$637 | \$0 | \$0 | \$637 | \$0 | \$0 |
| Office equipment and furniture | \$1,395 | \$0 | \$0 | \$1,395 | \$0 | \$0 |
| Information technology expense (e.g., computers and software) | \$2,341 | \$0 | \$0 | \$2,341 | \$0 | \$0 |
| Office supplies | \$10,400 | \$0 | \$0 | \$10,400 | \$0 | \$0 |
| Advertising | \$1,651 | \$0 | \$0 | \$1,651 | \$0 | \$0 |
| Dues and subscriptions | \$654 | \$0 | \$0 | \$654 | \$0 | \$0 |
| Payroll processing costs | \$2,328 | \$0 | \$0 | \$2,328 | \$0 | \$0 |
| Professional consulting - legal/accounting/interpretation/etc. | \$2,264 | \$0 | \$0 | \$2,264 | \$0 | \$0 |
| Allocated corporate office overhead | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 |
| Program supplies and participation fees | \$0 | \$0 | \$23,463 | \$0 | \$0 | \$23,463 |
| Other | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 |
| Subtotal - Other Operating Costs | \$33,512 | \$53 | \$85,942 | \$33,512 | \$53 | \$85,942 |
| Total Costs | \$55,159 | \$28,916 | \$453,948 | \$55,159 | \$28,916 | \$453,948 |
| Revenues | \$539,234 | \$539,234 | \$539,234 | \$539,234 | \$539,234 | \$539,234 |